

# TRAFFIC & TRANSPORT DELIVERY GROUP

## QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

Thursday 28 January 2010, 11.30 am at Hayle Town Council Committee Room

The ING development is pivotal on sustainable travel movement and they are encouraging rail use, so chicken and egg, if we haven't got the trains then we can't use them, if we can't use the trains we are told that we don't use them! The access has to be easily accessible for everyone including the disabled wheelchair users. Comments please.

*Bill Mitcham – on the construction of a new access as a public place this has to comply with Health and Safety legislation and design requirements and must be disabled compliant.*

At the risk of being controversial, I am slightly offended by the discussion of statics and the using the train, let me give you the old department store issue, the department had red dresses and blue dresses. All the red dresses sold and none of the blue. Next season the buyers would not buy red dresses as there were already blue dresses available and said they could sell these. The blue ones did not sell and they again asked for the red dresses but were told that they didn't sell any. We are in the situation where the number of trains has been reduced so that there are fewer to use. I am one of your statistics that says that I never use Hayle station I always use Hayle, why is that, if I go on a trip there is a train that leave St Erth and not Hayle but the one coming back might stop at Hayle but I have bought the ticket from St Erth for a round trip because I don't have any other way of doing that and I would gladly have taken it from Hayle if the train had stopped there. So your statistic says, just like the red dresses and blue dresses, everybody is using St Erth. Parking is a factor that comes into this. I can walk from Hayle station but I can't walk from St Erth with luggage, so you are completely ignoring the situation. You have reduced the number of trains, therefore, we are stuck with having to use St Erth probably because statistically it is more likely that if we take a return journey at least one of those stops is going to be St Erth. You look at the statistics up in Plymouth and say everyone is using St Erth, cut the trains in Hayle, so please this letter that you have from the lady which says that nobody is checking the tickets, people aren't buying, that is a statistic that has gone. Barrie, here no doubt will talk to you, tells us that there are far more people using the trains than your statistics show – so what is going on here.

*Julian Crow - I take the point entirely the trains that we took out a while back were based on the fact that very few people used them. We don't work on ticket sales when we do that because ticket sales tell us how many people are using the station overall they don't tell us anything about which trains they are using so we always use actual counts that are taken of people getting on and off trains.*

And you asked the people at St Erth if they would have used the one at Hayle if it had stopped, for example, that was part of your test?

*Julian Crow - We would look at the number of people actually using the trains that called at Hayle in that. It is worth saying a word about St Erth because I don't think that you can talk about Hayle without talking about St Erth, they are clearly very closely linked, and I guess to some extent Hayle had got to get out from under the shadow of St Erth. We had a very good year on the St Ives Branch this year, we carried ½ million people on that little line for the first time ever, and our policy there as with all the Cornish branches is to focus on what that line is really there for that line is really there to get all the visitors into and out of St Ives. Yes, we will try and plan connections there to be as good as possible with the branch line and there is very much a focus on St Erth as a parkway for West Cornwall. As you are aware we are working the county on a scheme for a major park and ride there 600 car parking spaces and a couple of hundred overflow. This is very much about doing two things, it is attracting the tourists, and we accept that even though our market share is increasing the vast majority of people are going to come down to Cornwall in their cars on holiday, what we are trying to do is find good ways of getting them out of their cars when they are down here and using the local rail network to get around. We are obviously conscious too of local travel needs and timetables will be planned to provide reasonably good connections there where we can. What has that got to do with Hayle, well the service at St Erth that car parking scheme is going to remain much as it is I am not sure that it is going increase much on the main line but that it will remain pretty much as it is. So for Hayle the question is the two markets there is a long distant market and the local market that distributes people around West Cornwall.*

*There is also the question of developments in and around Hayle, the Wave Hub and other things that are going to be happening here and I think it is going to be important for us to understand what local markets that is going to create, is it going to be long distant business, is it going to attract local people, is Hayle station actually located such that it is the best place to use given that there isn't a lot of parking and there isn't the opportunity to create a great deal. So a number of unanswered questions and opportunities, clearly we are always looking at ways of getting funding into the rail network, are these developments going to create any 106 money that can be used to develop the station and develop the services there. So that is a bit of a long answer to the question and it may well pose others. Coming back to the nub of the question, the chicken and egg, are there enough services to generate demand I will bounce that back and say OK, which are the*

*critical ones, I am very happy to have a debate on that, we have some more train counts coming up as to who is using the services and how we build a case to say no actually this is really what people need, where is the flow is it into Truro is it into Penzance is it elsewhere, is it people going to work, is it school children, what is the actual business base, where is that going to develop in the future?*

I would like to take you up on that count I am a regular commuter between Hayle and St Austell, or should that be St Erth and St Austell depending upon the timetable, Cornwall Council have called me a number of times asking me one question, what is the purpose of your journey. I think that it should be what is the purpose of your journey, what stations are you using, which one would you use. That takes me onto the point of the number of trains that stop at Hayle in the rush hour. One at 5.31 one at 6.11, 7.51 and one at 9.52. Between 7.51 and 9.52 there are two other trains that go through the station that could serve the likes of Truro and the community but they don't stop. The return one at 15.37, and then the next one that stops at Hayle is 17.50 now that to me is ludicrous because the one in between that actually leaves Paddington at 12.06 doesn't stop at Hayle and carries a huge amount of traffic to St Erth which then clogs up St Erth car park completely with people who are travelling back to Hayle. Now if we are looking at a sustainable environment and a sustainable transport system it is daft that you are encouraging people to drive from Hayle to St Erth just to drive back to Hayle. I have raised the point through complaints and I was told by First that the trains and the buses link together. I have been travelling regular commuter for 18 months now and they don't I have seen one bus at St Erth station as the train pulled in and the commuter went over the bridge the bus pulled off so integrated transport system does not work so that argument goes out of the window. I really feel as a commuter and talking to other commuters, and I did a rough count yesterday on the platform at Hayle, there were 30 people, more than St Erth, getting on the train. We need the trains to stop on the way home in the rush hour. One final point in the summer the train that leaves Plymouth at about 4.00 pm was abandoned and I assume that the rolling stock and staff were moved elsewhere, the high speed train from Paddington at about 1.00 pm comes through to Hayle inevitably for whatever reason and this is not a complaint it is delayed so people that would normally get off at Hayle during the rush hour have an extra half hour, some occasions  $\frac{3}{4}$  hour, added to their day because of the change in timetabling and cutting out that commuter train.

*Julian Crow - I think that the point about questioning people in the survey as to what their preference would be is actually a good point and I am sure that Bill will pick that up.*

*Bill Mitcham – yes, I am very pleased to hear you say that as we should have thought of that questions ourselves shouldn't we. Unfortunately the bad weather has stopped those surveys taking place but now that they are coming up we can add that as one of the things they enquire about.*

Joe Colliver - This business of people catching the train to Truro from Hayle, they come back but have to go on to St Erth and therefore, especially school children their parents have to go to St Erth to pick up their children to bring them back to Hayle. If that problem can be solved I think that it would be very helpful.

About six years ago the Chamber of Commerce had a brainstorming and presented the proposals to the community and one of them was to do with Hayle station. The logic there was going against the trend in the fact that it can be a vicious circle in that if you don't get enough people the accountants say we will limit the number of services that are going there, therefore, people don't go to Hayle station but go somewhere else as the service is not available, so we proposed the action and not too expensively to improve Hayle station, not just by putting signage up but by actually putting a presence in it, an ease for disabled people, something there eg a café but actually more, talking towards Cornwall Council, if you put facilities there that disabled could access, single people would not feel frightened about going on the platform, that would supply more people to satisfy your conundrum about the expense of stopping there and you would find, I guarantee, with the progress of this development in Hayle, an upward spiral because we are investing a little instead of using the logic of if nobody uses it cut it. I have often said that about new bus services being introduced after a little while people stop using it so the bus company puts the fare up to cover the fact that they are not getting so many people therefore less people use it. My logic being that if you actually cut the fares in half to encourage people to ride on the bus instead of charging more and cutting the service you would gradually have a service that worked. That is the logic that the Chamber of Commerce can up with but nobody seemed to pay us any heed at the time and I present it again.

Joe Colliver – one thing that I would like to say is that perhaps the Chamber of Commerce could negotiate with us, the Delivery Group, with finding premises perhaps to open a ticket office for two or three hours in the morning and again this is something that could be used to urge people to use the train.

Chamber – we will certainly do so.

I suspect that you may not all be working on the correct figures on population and holiday makers. I am very glad to hear that you have had great success with the branch lines and are, in fact, working to increase the success of the branch lines. Hayle has I think a static voting population of about 8,000 people and that, of course does not include people below the age of 18, and there has been a significant number of houses built since those numbers were crated. Hayle is a growing town and in the next five to seven years will be having a larger population than St Ives. No doubt the economic groupings will be different from St Ives but I think that we have a lot of people who don't have cars and use public transport as much as possible. That means that perhaps the concentration on the branch line to St Ives for eight nine months of the year when it is just local

people, and with Hayle being a bigger town with just a shed of trains stopping might be wrong and you might have to go and get more accurate figures, more accurate projections of the way to go. I got my figures from the old Cornwall website last year so they are not bang up to date. The other issue is, of course, the holiday trade, now no doubt it is this trade which through the holiday period keeps the branch lines going. St Ives is a great holiday place, money has been spent on the Falmouth line and there is of course, Newquay. People used to come on the trains to holiday in Newquay, Newquay pushed the fact that you could come to Newquay on the train. Now the biggest concentration of holiday beds in Cornwall is Newquay, some 27% of all holiday makers go to Newquay. Hayle has the second greatest concentration of beds in Cornwall, not Falmouth, not Penzance it is here. They go up to the Towans, to the sites that you can't see from the railway line, sites all around the area. Hayle is at the centre of the second densest concentration of holiday beds in Cornwall though admittedly it is perhaps the lower paying sites, camping caravans etc and a number will come by car but you are missing a trick here this little station that is shut all the time no one is using the railway line. Now, I don't mind too much but if you as a business cannot see the business opportunities and make some money out of these people that is down to you but I think that you need to look at your figures a bit more, see who is down here look at the demography of the place and see if you are missing the boat on this.

*Bill Mitcham – the surveys that are due are rail passengers and population only. The general demographics that you are talking about, no doubt, the results of those studies are being fed in to the regeneration proposals and they have been made available to you. The point being that for a major regeneration proposal such as that which is going on in Hayle there has to be a business case developed on all the statistics that you are talking about. But just on the rail figures we probably need with the additional question of where would you like to depart from we need to know that, not only in the winter when the numbers are lower and maybe we will see that Hayle higher than St Erth. But we need to repeat this in the summertime so that the holiday makers arriving that are not necessarily going to St Ives but are going back to accommodation in Hayle we need to know those figures as well. I can undertake now that in the summer when the holiday season picks up we will do that and we can feedback that information. On the point that Richard raised earlier, his invitation to belong to the area line group, if you like will enable all of the Hayle interests to be represented at that meeting and you can get straight to the likes of Julian and Richard so I would urge you to take up that invitation and attend future meetings.*

I think that we would like to. I think that if we could all think about the bit down from Truro to Penzance including us, think of all the business stops at Truro, so it is a branch line, as actually a branch line. I imagine that business stops at Truro, in some respects it does and then treat all of us as a branch line, so think of us as a branch line not just to Newquay, Par, Falmouth and St Ives ones but think of us as a branch line. How about some extra trains separate to the others, just going to Truro and back, serving the local community, subsidised, of course, by the 1<sup>st</sup> class transport people. There is one more thing that I would like to say about your surveys into rail users and why keep this train going shouldn't they put some movement into people who are not on the trains, why not go on the train because that is what we need to because those are the people that your business would welcome back. Why are you not on the train? Why are you using a car?

I want to pass you information that comes from the experience of my husband and myself running a local car rental company. We provide a service to people who are coming by train. We will meet them at the station when they are coming and departing. When they are coming to the Hayle area, the vast majority we will meet at St Erth for the very reasons that has already been stated that the majority of trains are not stopping at Hayle but stopping at St Erth. If people can come to Hayle they will and it is very convenient for us being based in Hayle town to meet them there. We very often have to drive out to St Erth and meet them there. They may be driving on to St Ives but a lot of them are coming back to the holiday parks that have been mentioned out on the Towans and we even have people to have a holiday let at Lelant Saltings right on the St Ives roundabout. They are having to get the car from us in St Erth drive into Hayle near Foundry to pick up their keys from the letting office and drive back out again. Whereas if they were able to get off the train in Hayle the office is just down the hill. So our experience is that there are a lot of car journeys shuttling backwards and forwards between Hayle and St Erth are unnecessary. If the train stopped at Hayle. That is one issue.

I have had friends come down to stay they actually came on the sleeper, thought they had to go to Penzance but they got off at St Erth. But the train in fact stopped in Hayle. They didn't get off in Hayle because they didn't realize that it stopped in Hayle. So there is an information vacuum as well and on at least a couple of occasions when trying to train tickets I have had someone at the other end of the phone saying that I have to change at St Erth to get a train to Hayle as they think that it is on the branch line, they don't know it is on the main one.

Joe Colliver - I think that it is that we need more trains stopping at Hayle and more information for the public.

*Julian Crow – well the information is there, the sleeper stops at Hayle, it is in the timetable, so not sure what went wrong there but I think that your main point is the general one about the number of calls.*

I think that it is an impression that comes across to people that trains don't stop in Hayle it has almost become

an entity. People assume that it doesn't and that is very sad.

*Julian Crow – I think that this comes back to the point that Richard B was making that getting some really good information around the local area.*

*I would like to come back on the bit about treating it as a branch line to Truro as I think that there is a lot of truth in that. As with everything in Cornwall we are trying to do two things with the same train. In many ways the high speed trains perform a local function to some of the county and clearly the local train service is exactly that. So I think that probably everyone would like to get to is to have a regular hourly service of trains through Cornwall, that comes at a price providing something between Truro and Penzance that involved an extra train we would be looking at a cost of somewhere north of £½ million to do that with an income that was nowhere near that figure so that is the economics of it. It is not an unrealistic long term ambition but getting there has got to be through a political route. There are a lot of opportunities in future years. There is a programme just under way for the replacement of the high speed trains that have been with us for between 30 and 40 years and the proposal for their replacement is tied up with electrification from London to Bristol, there is likely to be a new type of train that will run off overhead wires*

*So we won't see them*

*You will see them down here. That's a very critical part of the scheme because Great Western runs to so many places over all that we couldn't have just an electric replacement, it has got to be something that will run on diesel as well and there is an opportunity there to produce them in five coach modules is that you can end up with a more frequent service between Cornwall and London and combine that with a better local service on the network. Now that is something that is being pursued by the Department for Transport at the moment. We are hearing quite encouraging noises about the sort of frequencies that they are looking at and, of course, it will come into being, not during our franchise but the next one, so again there is very much a political dimension to that in lobbying for what you want the next time round. But coming back to the point, yes, I think it is very true that the local transport needs down here are much more aligned to a branch line than to a main line service but I wouldn't ever take my eye off the long distance traffic that is there as well as it is actually pretty valuable to all the communities down here in the west, that you do have that long distant service available to London both from the point of view of the local economy and the ability to bring holiday makers down.*

Our experience as a car hire company has been that if for example we need to get to Penzance to pick up a car we have got on the train at Hayle and we don't pay because nobody comes anywhere near us, we are unable to purchase a ticket. How many people travel between Hayle and Penzance and don't pay because nobody bothers to take their fares? How much income does First lose just through that?

*Julian Crow - I will feed that back to our revenue protection guys.*

I am not in a position where I have got a car so I use the trains a lot when I can if one stops here. It is very awkward to get to St Erth if you don't have your own transport. I will take my colleagues comments here about integrations between buses and trains, First Group own the buses, First own the trains – there is not linkage whatsoever between the two of you when it comes to timetabling. Go to Bodmin, Bodmin Parkway is miles away from the town centre, why does the bus leave five minutes before the train gets there. It is absolutely ridiculous. But on a Sunday in Hayle there is a train from Paddington or Plymouth that gets in at 11.06, 12.25, 1.00 and the next one 5.22, four hours twenty minutes between them. In that time four other trains have passed through Hayle. Coming back the other way it's the same thing, trains going through Hayle but there is a four hour gap between them. When it comes to later in the evening the last bus out of Penzance is at 7.35, you can't get a train then, so if you want to go into Penzance you are stuck and it is the same if you came from Penzance to Hayle, you can't get a bus back and there are not trains stopping. When are we going to get some train services that match the needs of the people. I met you four years ago, Mr Crow, and you assured me that you would come down every year to discuss timetabling issues. This is the first time that I have seen you in four years.

*Julian Crow - As I said we have a forum in St Ives where we come down twice a year and I am reasonably regularly in the west of Cornwall. I must challenge the point about providing a service that meets the need of people because the only reason that we have taken services out is because the fact that people are not using them. I am more than happy as I said earlier to look at what might generate business but I really need to be convinced that the business is actually there. It is a bit chicken and egg I know.*

Four hours between the trains is a bit much, OK two hours, but four hours, part of the reason why people aren't catching the train is because there is four hours.

*Julian Crow - I agree that it is a long gap.*

I am a commuter from Penzance to Hayle, I have travelled for eight years, in fact, today is the very last day I am travelling. I would like to raise one general point and a few specific.

1. There is the talk about the surveys. I have been almost a daily commuter from Penzance to Hayle for eight years and I have yet to be surveyed. I don't know what this survey is about and I know a lot about Hayle station.
2. Specifically, on the 8.46 from Penzance I would like to dispute specifically your statistics because I don't know where they came from. I was a regular daily passenger when it was 8.44 from Penzance

and stopped at Hayle. There were three regular passengers who boarded that train and we alighted at Hayle every single day. I always noticed that there would be between an estimated 7 to 10 people waiting on the Hayle platform to board the train. So when I heard the statistics that the train was then moved from 8.44 to 8.46, it just left Penzance two minutes later, they dropped the stop at Hayle and it was under the normal times through to London, the reason for that was that there was nobody using it, one apparent statistic was that one passenger got off and nobody was getting on. I don't know where your statistics came from, from what I saw. By pure coincidence Monday 6 December when the train timetable changed last year I happened to travel to London so I boarded the new 8.46 from Penzance and as we went through Hayle without stopping, there was 9 or 10 passengers standing on the platform with luggage waiting to get on it and looking very bemused as we shot straight through

3. The other thing that I would like to point out concerning the sleeper and the stop at Hayle on 6 January this year I travelled from Paddington to Hayle on the night sleeper. I telephoned the enquiry office to make my booking and was told that I could travel as far as Plymouth and there I had to get off the sleeper to board a train to take me down. When I challenged the person and said the sleeper stops they said no it doesn't you have to get off and there is another train that takes you on. They were offering to put me on to, I think that it is the Cross Country train, they didn't know that the train to Penzance stopped at Hayle and that is an actual, factual report. In the end they did find out and they did issue and post me the ticket to Hayle but I was being told and had I not challenged them I would be getting off at Plymouth at 5 in the morning and looking for some other train to take me on to Hayle. So I think that there is an issue there with your centralized booking system.

*Julian Crow - Well yes, I think that if you ever experience anything like that, you do know my email address, do drop me an email straight away and I will get that sorted out.*

But the main issue is this 8.46 that used to be the 8.44 and brought people to Hayle and took people on. What I saw is very different from the statistics that FGW were supplying and I say the general survey, and I don't know what this is as a daily commuter for 8 years and I have never yet been surveyed.

- One last thing, 14.22 yesterday I took into Penzance, seven passengers boarded, not one ticket was sold, we all got away without having to pay, I had a ticket but I don't know about the others. You lost at least 6 people's revenue on that 14.22 yesterday from Hayle into Penzance.

I wanted to say following on from our meeting at Truro, it is matter of confidence now. St Erth does come into the equation because people have lost confidence in Hayle station and so are going to St Erth to be sure of things. My wife will never go to Hayle station when she is going anyway because she is unsure whether that train will actually stop there. As soon as the confidence comes back and we tell the people of Hayle that you have got your train service back again and we advertise it in the town I am absolutely certain that your train usage will shoot up but you have got to give the people of the town confidence and to do that you have got to have trains that stop.

Could I add a proposal to that as it was exactly what I was going to say why don't we try, given my example of a bad statistic before and you have plenty of evidence that you've got incredibly bad statistics, why don't we try an experiment next year every train that stops at St Erth stops at Hayle. Now you can save some money, I don't think that the train at 5 something in the morning doesn't stop at St Erth or Hayle, it is quite a fast train. If you want to make more that don't stop at St Erth or Hayle fine. But every train that stops at St Erth stops at Hayle, you have one year descent statistics, we'll advertise everywhere that all trains will stop at Hayle, you don't have to think about it and see what happens.

John Pollard – I would like to pick up some points on that. I feel that we are being fobbed off. I am very grateful to Bill because I think that Bill is keen and those signs that we have been waiting for years and years and years will be there and that is terrific so thank you very much. But we met in November Julian and you told me that by the time you came to Hayle in January the counts would have been done. We have had enough good days with the weather and they haven't been done. You say that you are determined to help Hayle but you are taking trains away. You can provide no flexibility to improve the service and that is what is needed. The integration of trains and buses, I have been sitting in the West Cornwall Transport forum with Colin for ten years talking about that. We are still waiting for that to happen and until that happens there will be no future.

The St Ives branch line, Richard, you can use that from Hayle very effectively for two reasons

1. You can get a single ticket. I walk to St Ives sometimes and I buy a ticket back to Hayle because its cheaper than buying a return ticket to St Erth. Even though my car is in Lelant Saltings
2. It is almost impossible to use Hayle because you can't park there. So can we have a publicity campaign to encourage the thousands of people who stay in Hayle to have a service where they can get on a train in Hayle and go to St Ives conveniently and easily at regular times in the day. As for parking there is none at Hayle station, if I am going to London I have to go to St Erth because I can park there and leave the car for the day or two or three days. I can't go anywhere from Hayle station

because I can't guarantee that I can park the car there. There is land at the sidings, in front of the station if that was used as a railway car park then I am sure that it would be used. We need information in Hayle because the fact is that I often buy a rail ticket on line but if I want to know which bargain is best or cheapest I have to go to St Erth or Penzance because it is only by talking to the person in the ticket office that you get that information. We need that information available to Hayle

3. There is 106 money with the harbour development but it is all focused on making access to St Erth easier so that we can get on a train there. That money could be diverted to help Hayle but at the moment the integrated policy of trying to move people around the town so that they can access St Erth much more easily than Hayle.

I do feel we are going to meet the public and we can tell them that something is going to happen but as for everything else it is still lying on the table and I have no confidence that you are going to do anything about it.

*Julian Crow – why is all the section 106 money diverting people to St Erth*

John Pollard – because that is where the trains stop. Because you cut the service in Hayle.

*Julian Crow – I don't think that anybody has talked to us about that at all.*

*I think that the access is quite an important issue and I think that is possibly something that we can talk to the county about if there is land available that could be used as car parking.*

*I think that another question in my mind as I was listening to the debate about the number of holiday beds and the amount of accommodation in Hayle. How much of that is actually within walking distance of the station?*

All of it is possible. One of the key points is how easy is it to get to the station. Newquay campsites run shuttle services if we had buses to pick people up it would be so much better. Hayle matches in many case Manear and St Germans. Get off the train and drive around Hayle and see how big it is. Why have we got the same limited train service as these villages? Some one has missed out Hayle it is forgotten

Three questions two for Mr Crow and one for County

1. I was rather interested when you say that the station is not going to close. I have always thought that the station has closed and it became a halt. I am interested to know what is the difference between a halt and a station?

*Julian Crow - I don't think that there is a definition of either frankly a station is somewhere where trains stop and so is a halt.*

My definition would be a station is something that is manned, a halt is something where trains stop

2. Second point, I presume with reference to the eastern platform that you have completed a risk assessment and so have the county.

*Julian Crow - Anything that was done would include that.*

3. Would they be available for the Hayle Town Council to have a look at.

*I don't see why not. Clearly we would support anything that includes better access to the station, equally clearly if there is a trespass and a risk to people as a result then that is something that would have to be assessed as part of the whole scheme*

I would be very interested to see the risk assessment when completed by County and by the railway provider.

Joe Colliver – I am hoping that the Delivery Group will be able to have access to that

By all means but I am saying that I would like to have a look at it to see what we are talking about. Someone must have looked at it very subjectively and said that there are dangers or we can accept what is there I would just like to look at it.

*Bill Mitcham – I would just like to add to that that the local authority doesn't own the railway, of course, and Network Rail would be the organisation that would have done the risk assessment and I will enquire to see whether it exists.*

I am more than happy to accept that but I am sure that someone must, at Network Rail presumably, have completed that risk assessment.

4. The final point – I hear that there is going to be a 600 park and ride at St Erth, in the summertime do you imagine that is going to be filled by railway users or is it going to be available for other people.

*Richard Burningham – I'm not sure how to answer that but predictions are that the park and ride site during the peak period will be filled with rail users.*

One reason why people think that Hayle station is going to close is that they only need to get a copy of the timetable, there is no reference to Hayle or Camborne on the cover.

Second point is why can't a system such as used in the old steam days when people were picked up from stations by stopping trains, you have shuttles that do the same thing, they don't all stop here but surely the majority of shuttles that come from ports up to Truro and beyond could pick up from here say every other one, that would be better than waiting four hours and if you have got to pick up a main line train the specials like the Golden Hind in the morning could go right through. You could pick up at Truro on that one or other stations up the line. But surely there is a system that could be worked out where shuttles could stop here at least and pick the main line up further up the line.

*Julian Crow – it is the same point about local services and I have spent a lifetime in the rail industry so I know how things used to be done as well as how they are done now. I think that it might just be worth saying that what we provide, of course, is what the Department of Transport ask us to do in the franchise and the whole of the financial franchise is based upon that. If we want to do more than that that's fine but we have to have their permission but we don't get any funding for it so anything that we provide over and above what we are contracted to do is our financial risk. Therefore, we always proceed with great caution in terms of whether it is going to be economic to do that or not. If as a community you want a greater level of service than you have got then one of the ways in which to influence that is through the consultation process that the Department of Transport run every time a new franchise is let. Now I'm not seeking to hide behind that, that is how it works so hence our caution in adding things in that may not make money.*

Last point Hayle station is unique, it is built on top of a hill, access to one platform is bad, access to the station is bad, we haven't got the time here to present it but there is a project afoot whereby we think that we have got a possible answer to that, of which Jeremy Joslin has some details, but we can go back to the development group at a later date.

*Julian Crow – I shall be interested to see it*

Picking up on the point about confidence during December and January in fairness to FGW they ran a very good service through the very bad weather so thank you for that. However, the lack of real time information is a major factor in people not using Hayle. One morning the roads were very icy, the train manager couldn't make the train from Penzance that calls in at 7.50 to Hayle, fair enough but the train went straight through to Plymouth. People on the platform did not know what was going on. The next train was two hours later, were the other two trains in between going to stop at Hayle? You need to address real time information not in 18 months time, that is too long to wait, we need it now to give the confidence to the people on the platform. The little help point is next to useless as it is only on the southbound.

*Julian Crow – you are quite right about the help points. They were a very big step forward when they were put in in the past but their life expired and they don't work most of the time. We have a commitment that we made when we took the franchise that we will replace all of those, one on each platform not just one per station. As Bill mentioned earlier we are working with the County to enhance those so that you will have a real time information screen as part of the help point on each platform. That will happen during the current year. It is a £30 million scheme across the franchise, that is a lot of anybody's money and a big commitment about getting that real time information there.*

And if the train is cancelled or runs through then the next train will be indicated that it will stop at that station.

*Julian Crow – yes, you will get that sort of messaging on the screen.*

A couple of points

- Firstly, who are you actually running a railway for, is it for you or is it for the customers
- Secondly, you stated that it would be £½ million per annum to have a train stop at Hayle. How much does it cost to stop a train at Hayle, each time it stops. As why as per previous point why can't we have the train from Penzance to Truro stop at every stop and use this as a local service which is what it is for. It is not as if you have to divert them, they actually come through the station and it would probably put 10 to 15 minutes running time between Truro and Falmouth with a two minute stop at each available station. Yes, there will be extra fuel as you pull away but you can't use your high speed service on this part of the line anyway as it's not suitable for high speed trains. They come through here at 20 to 30 miles per hour as the restriction applies. So you are not looking at increasing the running costs or inconvenience to people by slowing high speed trains down as they have to already so I would like to know why we can't have all the stations manned, trains stopping at them and use the local service to encourage people to get out of their cars.

*Julian Crow – to answer your first question.*

- *Who are we running the railway for. We are running it under contract to the DfT. They consult with the regions and the counties before they let the contract to gather views about what sort of service is required. The extent to which the specification fits what people ask for is a matter that is not for me to comment upon. We run this franchise as a contract to DfT. Clearly as a franchisee our interest is in getting as many people onto the trains as we can. Our costs are relatively fixed the benefit to us is additional fare income. There have been many instances where we have been able to enhance the basic service working in conjunction with county councils and others if there is a requirement for*

*additional revenue funding or capital to meet the cost of running additional services. The Falmouth branch scheme is an excellent example of that where the County had a very visional scheme to build a passing loop to double the frequency of service which supports a lot of the economic objectives down there with the University, those coming to Truro, the economic development of Falmouth and so forth which costs capital to build the passing loop, revenue support for the additional services. Now, we are very happy to work on those schemes.*

- *The £½ million that I mentioned was not the cost of stopping the trains but the cost of funding an additional train to provide an enhanced frequency of service between Truro and Penzance. Yes, there is a real cost in stopping trains. Clearly it is far higher for high speed trains despite the fact that the line speed is not 125 through here, simply because you are stopping a very large heavy beast that costs a lot in fuel to accelerate it from nothing to 20 to 30 mph so there is a real cost in doing that, probably near £25 than £200 that sort of order of magnitude. Over the course of a year that runs up to a pretty big number. Coming back to the original point, if we believed that there is sufficient volume of customers to call additional services then we would be perfectly happy to do so.*

A couple of observations

- Looking at the service on a Saturday there are a lot of high speed trains stopping at Hayle on a Saturday compared with the rest of the week.
- I think that there is an opportunity, currently at St Erth the accessibility to the branch line travelling westbound you can't get across whereas at Hayle you can actually walk off. Bearing in mind that there is the car parking and turn around etc. I mention that because a lot of the work I deal with is improving people's access to services, Shopability etc. Maybe that is something that you can think about advertising. It may well be taking trains away from St Erth if people can't get across to the platform at the moment and I appreciate that the plans in the future there will be a new bridge at St Erth but as a short term measure it may be worth trying it out.

*Julian Crow – as you say part of the St Erth scheme will provide a lift bridge to provide full access to both platforms. We will, as a matter of policy, look at ways of providing level access to all platforms where we can do so.*

I think also for the future we want to change younger peoples travel habits and get them to use public transport and I think that the lack of ticketing in Hayle is important. If you could go and buy a ticket at the Post Office for example for a small investment surely we could have some progress there.

*Julian Crow – there are several ways of approaching the ticketing issue through bridges and offices with partnership tickets on sale through village shops, post offices up the Tamar valley and elsewhere. That might be appropriate down here.*

Looking at the document from Hayle Area Plan Partnership's minutes of the meeting on 3 November. From some of the comments that have been expressed here I would gather that you haven't read it, or haven't taken on board what it says because you were surprised for example about people not being charged for tickets. It was in this document and a number of other things. So my plea is, don't lets have more words and talk and talk can we have a timetable when some of the actions agreed in this are actually going to happen because otherwise we will be here in another 6 months having yet another meeting. So it would be useful, Julian if we could have some idea of when the things that were in this document that were auctioned for various people are actually going to happen. It is an excellent document.

Joe Colliver – For the future we will keep in close contact with these gentlemen and we will continue having meetings and try and guide the process of getting people to use the trains and use Hayle station in the coming weeks and months.

*Julian Crow – I am very happy to work with you and I will make one observation that is if people want something to happen they are always in a more powerful position than those who don't want it to happen – so keep at it. I have welcomed the debate – keep pushing for what you want we will do what we can to provide that.*

John Pollard - and we will be working with you from the Partnership as well

Joe Colliver – I can only tell you that the Delivery Group for Hayle, we will do our best to accommodate rail travel and bus travel in the future because we know a lot of traffic problems are going to be in Hayle if the development takes.